

#### 1. CAS/CPS Data

Country	<i>.</i> .	Mozambique
Country		WUZambiyue

CAS/CPS	Year: FY12	

CLR Review Period: FY12 – FY15<sup>1</sup>

CAS/CPS Period: FY12 – FY15

Date of this review: April 12, 2017

#### 2. Ratings

	CLR Rating	IEG Rating	
Development Outcome:	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	
WBG Performance:	Fair	Fair	

#### 3. Executive Summary

i. Mozambique is a low income country with a GNI per capita of \$1,120 in 2014. The country experienced rapid growth over the last 25 years, but high poverty rates persist, particularly in the rural areas. The economy grew at 8.0 percent per year between 1992 and 2016, although its growth slowed down to 7.2 percent during the review period. Data from the National Statistics Institute show that the poverty headcount ratio fell from 70 to 46 percent between 1996 and 2014. However, rapid economic growth did not translate to inclusive growth as the Gini coefficient rose to 0.47 in 2014, from 0.40 in 1996. The country's reliance on capital intensive investments led to rapid economic growth but generated relatively few jobs and their ties to the rest of the economy are limited. Unemployment rate remained at 22.6 percent in 2012-2014. The country ranks low in Human Development Index: 180 out of 188 countries. Natural hazards hit the country frequently and hard, and are likely to worsen with climate change.

ii. The government's Action Plan to Reduce Poverty for 2011-2014 (Plano de Acção de Redução de Pobreza -PARP) sought to confront these problems and the WBG's Country Partnership Strategy (CPS) addressed some of these challenges under the pillars of competitiveness and employment (Focus Area I), vulnerability and resilience (Focus Area II), and a foundation pillar, governance and public sector capacity (Focus Area III). The pillars were relevant to support the PARP. In April 2016, the government acknowledged to the IMF that it had borrowed an amount in excess of \$1 billion in commercial terms during 2012-2015. The disclosure weakened investors' confidence in the country's macroeconomic stability, and contributed to further depreciating the metical. These two factors combined raised the country's debt to GDP ratio from 60 percent in 2014 to 120 percent in 2016.

iii. IEG rates the development outcome of the CPS FY12-FY16 as *Moderately Satisfactory*. The program achieved or mostly achieved its objectives in the regulatory environment, employment and growth in targeted areas of the tourism sector, in road infrastructure, water and sanitation, affordable telecommunications, education and skills of the work force, improved health services for the vulnerable, improved capacity of local administrations to manage public finances, better

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> In line with the CLR, the CLR Review covers the period FY 12-15 and is updated to reflect progress in FY 16. The new CPF was delayed due to the discovery of hidden sovereign debt in 2016 which had not been reported to the World Bank and IMF.

CLR Reviewed by:	Peer Reviewed by:	CLR Review Manager/Coordinator
Jorge Garcia-Garcia	Albert Martinez	Pablo Fajnzylber
Consultant, IEGHE	Consultant, IEGEC	Manager, IEGEC
Igor Artemiev		Lourdes Pagaran
Consultant, IEGHE		Senior Evaluation Officer, IEGEC



conservation of wildlife, and more transparency in extractive industries. The program had partial success in raising agricultural productivity. The program did not produce results in spatial planning, adaptation to climate change, electricity access, social protection, public financial management, and public service monitoring.

iv. IEG assesses overall WBG performance as *Fair*. WBG selected objectives that supported the government's development plan, but it could have been more focused to achieve greater impact. The results framework reflected the fragmentation of the program with 17 objectives and 30 outcome indicators. Some program objectives were associated with several interventions but the activities they supported were not directly related to the program's objectives and the expected results. IFC interventions were not always part of the results matrix. As in previous CPS, the WBG did not undertake a performance learning review, which was a lost opportunity for mid-course corrections. According to the CLR, management should have assumed greater leadership role and engaged the development community and the government on substantive issues and paid more attention to the political economy context to prevent delays in project implementation. Compliance with Bank's safeguards policies was generally satisfactory but there were some shortcomings. On fiduciary issues, there was an unusually high number of complaints in the education sector. Although none of the complaints were investigated, the high number of complaints indicate some underlying structural governance issues.

v. IEG concurs with the CLR findings, lessons and recommendations: (a) the need for the Bank to assume strategic leadership on substantive issues with donor partners and government; and proactive management of the WBG program, including maintaining a stable international staff in the field; (b) consolidation and better integration of Bank's portfolio for greater impact; and (c) strengthening the Bank's political economy and institutional assessments to inform project design and implementation, and aligning Bank's program ambition with the country's implementation capacity.

vi. IEG adds the following lessons: (a) With limited program envelope and implementation capacity constraints at the country level, the Bank could focus more on limited and strategic interventions, building on its comparative advantage and ensuring sustained management attention and engagement during program implementation; (b) Better alignment of program interventions with program objectives are critical to enhance program effectiveness and impact. Hence, there is need for greater selectivity in the choice of interventions to achieve results. In the case of Mozambique, some objectives have multiple interventions that did not directly contribute to program objectives and outcomes; (c) IFC's contributions and alignment to the WBG program would need to be better articulated and reflected in the program results framework.

## 4. Strategic Focus

## **Overview of CAS/CPS Relevance:**

Relevance of the Country Partnership Strategy:

1. **Congruence with Country Context and Country Program**. The government's Action Plan to Reduce Poverty (Plano de Acção de Redução de Pobreza -PARP) had three general objectives and two supporting pillars. General objectives were to boost production and productivity in agriculture and fisheries, promote employment, and human and social development. Supporting pillars were good governance and macroeconomic stability. The CPS addressed some of these challenges under the pillars of competitiveness and employment, vulnerability and resilience, and the foundation pillar governance and public sector capacity. The pillars were relevant to support the PARP.

2. Since 1992, when the civil war ended, Mozambique grew at 8.0 percent per year until 2016. GNI per capita almost tripled to \$1,120 in 2014. Growth led to reduction in poverty: poverty headcount ratio dropped from 70 percent in 1996 to 46 percent in 2014. In urban areas poverty fell from 62 to 37 percent and in rural areas from 72 to 50 percent. Rapid growth has increased access to basic services (primary schooling, safe water, sanitation, electricity). However, rapid growth was



accompanied by a growing disparity in the distribution of consumption, as the Gini coefficient for consumption rose to 0.47 in 2014 from 0.40 in 1996. The country's reliance on capital intensive investments accounted for a larger share of overall growth, but they generate relatively few jobs and their ties to the rest of the economy are limited. Unemployment rates remained at 22.6 percent during 2012-2015. To diversify, the country needs to improve the regulatory climate, physical infrastructure, and rely on private sector development.

3. Mozambique's socioeconomic indicators have improved since 1992, but their numbers still reflect substantial problems. Maternal mortality is around 500 per 100,000 births, and infant and child mortality (under 5) are 57 and 79 per 1000 births. The enrolment rate in primary schools reached 79 percent in 2014 and literacy rates for men and women aged 15-24 reached 80 and 57 percent as of 2009 (WDI data). The country ranks low in Human Development Index (180 out 188 countries). Natural hazards hit the country frequently, cost large sums of money (estimates are of \$400 million per year), and are likely to worsen with climate change.

4. In April 2016, the government acknowledged to the IMF that it had borrowed an amount in excess of \$1 billion in commercial terms during 2012-2015. The disclosure weakened investors' confidence in the country's macroeconomic stability, and contributed to further depreciating the metical. These two factors combined raised the country's debt to GDP ratio from 60 percent in 2014 to 120 percent in 2016.

5. **Relevance of Design**. The three focus areas were supported by interventions that were appropriate to achieve the strategy's objectives in most cases, but with some shortcomings. Some of the program interventions supported activities that were not directly linked to program objectives. The program was fragmented and dispersed and did not consider the limited capacity of government entities to implement the program. The strategy could have articulated better how the interventions beyond those specific to agriculture would benefit people living in rural areas, where most of the poor live. The review also notes the relatively low relevance of some interventions including the spatial development planning project, a complex program for a country with serious constraints in its executing capacity.

#### Selectivity

6. Most of the program focused on seeking solutions to relevant problems, concentrating its financial support for activities in infrastructure and human capital, where Mozambique faces serious problems. The objectives selected were based on adequate country diagnostics (AAA and TA). The program objectives were consistent with the Bank's comparative advantage, but its results could have been enhanced if the program had been less fragmented, with fewer but more focused results. The program design could have benefitted from a closer cooperation between the WB and IFC to exploit better the synergies-of that cooperation.

## <u>Alignment</u>

7. The CPS was designed prior to the adoption of the corporate twin goals of reducing poverty and increasing shared prosperity. The program supported interventions in health and education, basic infrastructure (water, sanitation, electricity), and roads that could reduce transport costs and bring better prices to farmers and people living in rural areas. The interventions in governance, vulnerability, and resilience, sustainability of natural resources and wildlife and the transparency in the use of government resources, could contribute to the twin goals.

## 5. Development Outcome

## Overview of Achievement by Objective:

8. The WBG did not undertake a Performance and Learning Review. In line with the shared approach, the assessment of the program's development outcome will be based on the original program results of the CPS.



#### Focus Area I (CPS Pillar I): Competitiveness and Employment.

9. **Objective 1. Improved regulatory environment in targeted areas.** This objective was supported by a Competitiveness and PSD credit (FY09), a financial sector TA, PRSCs 8-10, an IFC investment climate project, and IFC advisory activities to build capacity of micro, small and medium enterprises (MSME) and improve their access to finance. Two indicators measured the achievement of the objective:

- <u>Number of days to issue industrial and commercial licenses</u>. For industrial licenses the time fell from 32 days in 2010 to 13 days in November 2014, and for commercial licenses it fell from 22 days in 2010 to 7 days in May 2015. The reductions exceed the 50 percent decline expected for each type of license [*Achieved*].
- <u>Number of days to clear imports and exports</u>. For imports the number of days to clear customs fell from 32 to 25; for exports the time fell from 26 to 21 days. The reductions fell short of the target values, 16 days for imports and 13 days for exports [*partially achieved*].

The indicators, though important, only measured part of the effort required to complete the tasks needed to register a business and clear customs. Other indicators on the regulatory environment suggest that starting a business still faces many hurdles. According to the Doing Business report for 2016 the time to register a business remains unchanged at 19 days since 2011. Achieving some results could come from better administration in customs and the agencies issuing licenses, from better regulations that dismantle processes and streamline the licensing and customs system, or a combination of the two. The CLR does not explain and articulate the links between the interventions and the improvements under these two indicators.

The review concludes the objective was mostly achieved.

10. **Objective 2. Improved management of development process through spatial planning.** The objective was supported by the Integrated Growth Pole (FY13), a Mining and Gas project (FY13), and two pieces of ESW: Growth Identification Note, and Infrastructure through Spatial Lens. Two output indicators would measure the achievement of this objective: number of spatial development projects adopted for their feasibility by government, private sector, and PPP, and number of projects identified with high employment potential for each spatial development initiative. The target indicators were not achieved due to the slow start of the Integrated Growth Pole project.

The review concludes the objective was not achieved.

11. **Objective 3. Increased crop yields and overall productivity in target areas**. The objective was supported by two irrigation projects (FY06, FY11), two development policy operations for agriculture (DPO 1/FY13 and 2/ FY14) in agriculture, a policy note for an agriculture strategy, and two IFC investment (Pulp and paper and wheat and maize miller) and advisory activities on insurance. The expected results were:

- <u>Higher yields (tons per hectare, ton/ha) of potatoes and tomatoes</u>. The higher yields would result, presumably, from the irrigation projects. Since the information on yields between the CPS and the CLR is not consistent, this review uses the information from the CPS for baseline values and targets, and the information from the CLR and ISRs/ICRs for actual results. The expected outcomes were yields of 23 tons/ha for tomato and of 18 tons/ha for potato. The CLR reports yields of 16 tons for tomatoes and 18 tons for potato [mostly achieved].
- <u>Eight thousand (8,000) smallholders with access to finance by 2015</u>. The CLR does not report from which project to expect this result. Again, the CPS and the CLR differ in the indicators: CPS: 8000 small holders with access to farmer credit, of which 33 percent are women; CLR: beneficiary subprojects approved for grant. In total, 1626 beneficiary subprojects were approved for grant, but the total number of farmers is not provided [*partially achieved*].

A variety of Bank and IFC activities supported this objective, but some activities have no direct relation with both the objective and the results indicators.



The review concludes the objective was partially achieved.

12. **Objective 4. Increased employment and growth in targeted areas of the tourism sector**. This objective was supported by two completed projects (Trans frontier Conservation Areas & Tourism Development -FY06- and a Competitiveness and PSD -FY09), a technical assistance to reform the fisheries sector, and an IFC Tourism Anchor Program. The expected results were to:

- Increase the number of local people employed in tourism and targeted areas from 1,300 in 2010 to 2,800 by 2015. The CLR reports that 2,027 local people were employed in June 2014. [Achieved]
- Increase the number of bed-nights in tourism facilities from 164,000 in 2010 to 240,000 by 2015. The CLR reports that the number of bed-nights increased to 196,000. [Mostly Achieved]

Two comments on the indicators. First, the economy grew when the projects were active, hence the increase in employment could not be fully attributed to the projects. Second, employment in the tourism sector depends on the demand for accommodation services; thus, the two indicators are overlapping and using the two overlapping indicators counts project benefits twice.

The review concludes the objective was mostly achieved.

13. **Objective 5. Improved provision and management of road infrastructure**. The objective was supported by one Road and Bridge APL project (FY07, FY11 additional financing), a Roads and Bridges Management and Maintenance III (FY13), one TA project for spatial development planning (FY11), the Integrated Growth Poles project (FY13), and an ESW on infrastructure through spatial lens. The expected results were:

- <u>Share of total roads classified in good and fair condition increases from 75 percent in 2010 to</u> <u>78 percent in 2012</u>. The target date is an odd one, since it is set at the start of the CPS. The CLR revised the indicator but there is no CPS progress report to support the change. The CLR reports the share of roads in good and fair condition reached 68 percent in December 2015. Due to bad weather (cyclones and flooding) that occurred between 2012 and 2015, the percentage of roads in good and fair condition never reached the target of 78 percent set in the CPS. [*Not achieved*].
- <u>Share of rural population with access to an all-season road increases from 31.8 percent in</u> <u>2010 to 32.3 percent in 2012</u>. The share of the population with access to all season roads had increased to 34.2 percent as of December 2014. [*achieved*]
- Number of people in Maputo municipality with access to all-seasons road increases from 60,000 tin 2010 to 300,000 in 2015. The CLR reports the target was exceeded in December 2014, with more than 400,000 people with access to all-seasons road [achieved].

The review concludes the objective was mostly achieved.

14. **Objective 6. Improved provision of water and sanitation service**. This objective was supported by two water projects in the Maputo area (FY11, FY14), one institutional support project (FY08), and one National Water Resources Project (FY12). IFC started a PPP in FY 13 aimed at evaluating options for attracting private sector participation to the water sector in Maputo. The expected results were:

- <u>In 2015, about 290,000 people would have access to improved water sources.</u> The CLR reports 795,000 people in urban areas gained access to improved water sources. However, the CLR does not explain why there is such large discrepancy between actual and target results. [achieved].
- In 2015, the number of people in Maputo municipality with access to solid waste collection reaches 1.04 million, up from 729,000 in 2010. The CLR reports that by June 2015 about 1.13 million people in Maputo had access to regular solid waste collection. [achieved].

The review concludes the objective was achieved.



15. **Objective 7**. **Improved access to electricity**. Two projects, the Transmission Upgrade (FY08) and the Energy Development and Access APL2 (FY10), supported this objective. The Bank expected that about 67,500 people and 400 rural schools and 400 health clinics would have access to electricity by 2015. The objective was not achieved because there were substantial delays in implementing the project. [*Not achieved*].

16. **Objective 8**. **Improved access to affordable communications**. This project was supported by the regional e-government and communications infrastructure (FY09). The target was to promote access to internet services and reduce their cost. The Bank supported to enlarge the number of telecom operators from two to three. One of them, MOVITEL, rolled out extensive fixed and mobile network facilities, leading to more competition and to lower costs for the services, from \$33 per 3Mbps/month in 2010 to \$17 per 3Mbps/month in December 2014. The CLR does not report on prices during 2015, but the tariff in 2014 is lower than the expected one of \$30 per 1Mbps per month set in the CPS [achieved].

The review concludes the objective was achieved.

17. **Objective 9. Better educated and skilled labor force**. Four projects supported this objective. Two projects support technical and vocational education (FY06, FY12), one project supports the education sector (FY11), and one project supports higher education science and technology (FY10). The support from ESW is unclear. The CLR lists an ESW on Healthcare Financing Analysis (FY13) as supporting education, but does not explain the link of health to education. The achievement of this objective was to be measured by the following indicators:

- <u>Improve employment prospects of students in vocational programs</u>. The target was to have 60 percent of graduates employed in related fields within six months of graduation by 2015. The actual number was 57 percent [*mostly achieved*].
- Raise to 90 percent the share of students moving from primary to post-primary in 2015. The transition rate reached 92 percent in 2014, from 79 percent in 2010. World Development Indicators (WDI) data show the effective transition rates from primary to lower secondary at 62 percent in 2013. The CLR reports that primary completion rate has stagnated but does not provide numbers; ensuring that students complete their primary education is more important than ensuring that the few students who complete it move to post-primary education. This indicator is inadequate to gauge the progress in education, and hides the problem of low graduation rates in primary and lower secondary education, at 48 and 22 percent in 2014 per WDI data. The review concludes that although the indicator was achieved, it is not sufficient to measure the program objectives and the link between this indicator and the objective is weak. [achieved].
- <u>Raise by 30 percent -from 7,000 to 9,100- the number of students graduating from higher</u> <u>education institutions</u>. The CLR reports the number of graduates in 2014 reached 10,929, surpassing its target. [*achieved*].

The review concludes the objective was mostly achieved.

IEG rates **Focus Area I as moderately satisfactory.** The program achieved or partially achieved seven of its nine objectives. It achieved or mostly achieved its objectives of improving the regulatory environment, increasing employment and growth in targeted areas of the tourist sector, improving provision of management and road infrastructure, improving access to water and sanitation services, improving access to affordable telecommunications, having a better educated and skilled workforce. The program partially achieved its objective of increasing crop yields and overall productivity in targeted areas, but did not achieve its objective of improving management of the development process through spatial planning.

#### Focus Area II (CPS Pillar II): Vulnerability and Resilience

18. **Objective 10. Improved health services for the vulnerable**. The objective was supported by one ESW (FY13), one impact evaluation study (FY12) and three projects. Only two projects were active during the CPS period: Health services FY09 and Commodity Security FY11; the nutrition



project (FY13) started later than planned. Earlier ESW informed the design of the Health project (FY09), but the CLR did not report on how the ESW on Health Care Financing (FY13) and the impact evaluation study were used. The achievement of this objective was to be measured by three indicators:

- <u>Raise institutional deliveries (child delivered in some medical facility)</u>. The target was to increase to 72 percent the share of institutional deliveries in three Northern provinces (Niassa, Nampula, and Cabo Delgado) in 2015. The implementation status report of the health project (ISR #16) reports that institutional deliveries reached 84 percent in Nampula and 78 percent in Cabo Delgado, exceeding the 72 percent target; the ISR does not report on Niassa [mostly achieved].
- <u>Provide antiretroviral treatment (ART)</u>. The target was to provide with ART close to 410,000 adults and children in 2015. The actual number treated was close to 586,000 persons by December 2014, exceeding the target (*achieved*).
- <u>Improve diet of children aged 6-23</u>. The program did not start on time and did not deliver on expected results due to delays in implementing the nutrition project [*not achieved*].

On balance, the review concludes the objective was mostly achieved.

19. Objective 11. Adaptation to climate change and reduced risk of natural disasters. The objective was supported by a Water Resources Development Project (FY12), a coastal cities and climate change project (FY12), an Emergency Resilient Recovery Project (FY2016), an IFC umbrella program for Africa called Building Africa's Resilience to Climate Change (BAREC), and grants for (a) disaster risk management (FY11),(b) supporting a pilot program on climate resilience and hydro meteorological services (FY13), (c) reducing emissions from deforestation and forest degradation (REDD, FY12), and (d) technical assistance of the global facility for disaster reduction and recovery. There was only one indicator to measure the achievement of this objective. The expected result was to have an accurate weather information system available to stakeholders in 70 percent of the central and southern regions by 2015. The US\$15 million trust fund grant for climate resilience supported the installation and calibration of some weather radars in the south and central regions but are not fully functional. The Bank also supported several activities that went beyond meteorological stations. The single indicator does not seem to sufficiently measure the two dimensions of the program objective of adaptation and risk reduction. Given that several WBG interventions supported this program objective, it would have been useful to provide both process/output and outcome indicators to measure progress against the two dimensions of this objective

The review concludes the objective was not achieved.

20. **Objective 12. Strengthened social protection.** The program sought to reduce the vulnerability of the population to, among others, variations in climate, commodity prices, and agricultural productivity. This objective was supported by a Pilot Public Works Program (FY11), a Social Protection Project (FY13), and an ESW on Social Protection Assessment (FY13). About 23,000 of the 100,000 expected beneficiaries had been reached as of August 2016. The CPS target was to reach of 815,000 vulnerable people from the social safety program. The CLR provided additional information and notes progress towards establishing a unified targeting approaches across core social safety net programs, and single registry of social security beneficiaries. However, since there was no PLR, the original indicator at the CPS stage is the basis for measuring the success of the program which rests on reaching its target population, which has not yet materialized.

The review concludes the objective was not achieved.

21. IEG rates Focus Area II as **unsatisfactory**. The program had one notable achievement in improving health services for the vulnerable, but did not achieve its objectives in helping to strengthen social protection, adapt to climate change and reduce the risk of natural disasters.

## Focus Area III (CPS Foundation Pillar): Governance and Public Sector Capacity

22. **Objective 13. Improved public financial management.** The objective was supported by a National Decentralized Planning project (FY13), a grant for a Public Financial Management program



for results (PforR), and two pieces of AAA, including a Public Expenditure Review (PER, FY15). Achieving this objective would be measured by (a) three indicators of the public expenditure and financial accountability program (PEFA) improve from C to B; and (b) at least 65 percent of state investment expenditure subject to competitive bidding in 2015. The improvements in the PEFA indicators, which referred to composition of spending, external audit, and multiannual fiscal planning for spending and budget policies, were not achieved. The 2015 PEFA assessment shows that all three PEFA indicators were unchanged (at C). The second indicator was dropped. [not achieved].

The review concludes the objective was not achieved.

23. **Objective 14. Improved capacity of local administration to manage public finances.** The objective was supported by the National Decentralized Planning project (FY10), a public financial management program for results (FY13), and a FY14 technical assistance from the Public-Private Infrastructure Advisory Facility to enhance financial management practices in municipalities. The TA sought to assist four municipalities with the greatest potential for raising revenue among the 20 selected cities that make part of a component in the Cities and Climate Change Project. The expected result was to have by June 2015 at least 110 districts executing more than 90 percent of their budget and operational plans. The CLR, and the ICR and ISR#10 report for the National Decentralized Planning project indicate that the target was achieved [a*chieved*].

The review concludes the objective was achieved.

24. **Objective 15. Improved citizen participation in public service monitoring**. The objective was supported by the Maputo Municipal Development Project (FY11) and a Public Financial Management PforR (FY13). The indicator was to maintain the mean user's perception of the quality of public services in Maputo at 2.8 from 2011 to 2013 and to reach 3.0 in 2015 as reported in the Citizen Report Card. The most recent ISR for the Maputo project (Sequence 13, December 8, 2016) notes that the indicator is at 2.7 from a target of 3.0. The which suggests that people's perception on the quality of municipal services fell since then. [*not achieved*].

The review concludes the objective was not achieved.

25. **Objective 16. Greater contribution of wildlife conservation to economy**. The objective was supported by two projects: The Trans-Frontier Conservation Area and Tourism Project I (FY06) and the South West Indian Fisheries Project (FY14), two GEF grants and one grant for reducing emissions from deforestation and forest degradation (REDD). The CLR reports the following increase in species between 2006 and 2012:

- Maputo Special Reserve. Elephants 197 percent, and zebra 93 percent;
- Zinave National Park. Impala 204 percent, and nyala 81 percent;
- Banhine National Park. Oribi 682 percent, and ostrich 150 percent; and
- Chimanimani Reserve. Dulker 186 percent, and sable 250 percent.

The indicators cover the period 2006-2012, not the 2011-2015 period established in the CPS. An IEG review of the ICR for the Trans-Frontier Conservation Area and Tourism project concluded that the improved wildlife counts reflected improved control over poaching as patrols had become more formal and frequent, and had perhaps also led to modifications in community hunting behavior [*achieved*].

The review concludes the objective was achieved.

26. **Objective 17. Improved transparency in extractive industries.** The objective was supported by: (a) four grants to help Mozambique become member and comply with the extractive industries transparency initiative (EITI); (b) a gas and mining TA project (FY13) (FY14); and (c) AAA that provides technical assistance on mining sector governance and on the extractive industry value chain (EI Value Chain TA). With the support provided, it was expected that Mozambique would achieve and maintain EITI compliant status from the International EITI Board. Since 2013 Mozambique is EITI compliant and issues annual reports. The fifth report was issued under EITI standard, and the First Annual Implementation Report for Mozambique EITI was published in early 2015. [achieved]



The review concludes the objective was achieved.

27. IEG rates Focus Area III as **moderately satisfactory**. Achievements were noted in three objectives including improved transparency in extractive industries, greater contribution of wildlife conservation to the economy, and improved capacity of local administrations to manage public finance. The program did not achieve two of its objectives of improving citizen participation in public service monitoring and improving public financial management.

#### **Overall Assessment and Rating**

28. IEG rates the development outcome as **moderately satisfactory**. The program achieved or mostly achieved 10 of the 17 objectives in the regulatory environment, employment and growth in targeted areas of the tourism sector, in road infrastructure, water and sanitation, access to electricity, affordable telecommunications, education and skills of the work force, improved health services for the vulnerable, improved capacity of local administrations to manage public finances, better conservation of wildlife, and more transparency in extractive industries. The program had partial success in raising agricultural productivity, but did not achieve its objectives in spatial planning, electricity access, adaptation to climate change, social protection, public financial management, and public service monitoring.

Objectives	CLR Rating	IEG Rating
I. Competitiveness and Employment	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory
Objective 1: Improved regulatory environment in targeted areas	Mostly achieved	Mostly achieved
Objective 2: Improved management of development process through spatial planning	Partially achieved	Not achieved
Objective 3: Increased crop yields and overall productivity in target areas	Partially achieved	Partially achieved
Objective 4: Increased employment and growth in targeted areas of the tourism sector	Mostly achieved	Mostly achieved
Objective 5: Improved provision and management of road infrastructure	Achieved	Mostly achieved
Objective 6: Improved provision of water and sanitation service	Achieved	Achieved
Objective 7: Improved access to electricity	Not achieved	Not achieved
Objective 8: Improved access to affordable communications	Achieved	Achieved
Objective 9: Better educated and skilled labor force	Mostly achieved	Mostly achieved
II. Vulnerability and Resilience	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory
Objective 10: Improved health services for the vulnerable	Mostly achieved	Mostly achieved
Objective 11: Adaptation to climate change and reduce risk of natural disasters	Partially achieved	Not achieved
Objective 12: Strengthened social protection	Partially achieved	Not achieved
III. Governance and Public Sector Capacity	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory
Objective 13: Improved public financial management	Not Achieved	Not achieved
Objective 14: Improved capacity of local administration to manage public finances	Achieved	Achieved
Objective 15: Improved citizen participation in public service monitoring	Mostly Achieved	Not achieved
Objective 16: Greater contribution of wildlife conservation to economy	Achieved	Achieved
Objective 17: Improved transparency in extractive industries	Achieved	Achieved



## 6. WBG Performance

#### Lending and Investments

29. Forty-three credits for \$2,457 million were active during the program period (FY12-FY15). Of those, 20 credits for \$940 million corresponded to projects active when the CPS was approved, and 23 credits for \$1,517 million during the CAS period. Of the 24 planned credits, 17 were approved. More than \$1 billion financed infrastructure works (roads, energy, water). About \$400 million went to the social sectors (education and health), \$330 million (budget support through PRSCs), climate change and biodiversity (\$210 million), governance and subnational government (\$130 million), and private sector development, financial sector, PforR (\$267 million). Mozambique also benefited from 45 trust funds, for \$322 million.

30. Mozambique has better project outcome ratings at exit than AFR and the Bank when measured by number of projects but poorer performance when measured by value. Twelve projects that closed during the period were validated by IEG; 10 were rated satisfactory or moderately satisfactory, and 2 were rated unsatisfactory or moderately unsatisfactory. Of the active projects 30 were rated satisfactory or moderately satisfactory, and two moderately unsatisfactory.

31. During the review period, IFC committed \$132 million long term investments, and extended to a Mozambican bank a line of short-term revolving trade guarantees under the Global Trade Finance Program (GTFP). Of the total long-term investment, manufacturing accounted for 36 and agribusiness and forestry for 60 percent. Investment in an iron-ore exploration project accounts for the remaining four percent. Of the new committed investments, 30 percent was equity and 70 percent was loans, and 62 percent of them went to greenfield projects. The milling project has been rated Mostly Successful in the development outcomes tracking system (DOTS). The remaining 11 projects has been rated "Too Early to Tell", including an iron ore exploration project initiated in FY09.

32. MIGA granted one new guarantee to a South African power producer for \$115 million, to cover investments in a natural gas-fired power plant with a Mozambican producer. Also, it maintained as *active* the status of guarantees for \$100 million for 3 projects that had been initiated before FY12 and that were still in effect (i.e., active); the three projects were a sugar plantation, a woodchip plant, and a high voltage power line.

#### Analytic and Advisory Activities and Services

33. During the review period, the Bank's analytical and advisory work (AAA) consisted of 31 pieces, of which 8 were economic and sector work (ESW) and 23 were technical assistance. The eight ESW pieces consisted of policy notes for the new government, of which five emphasized governance and fiscal policy, and two others covered cultural heritage and tourism and financial sector development. The TA covered many areas: disaster risk management, monitoring resistance to insecticide in malaria control, governance and public financial management, value chains, social protection, education, mining and gas, EITI, water and sanitation, among others.

34. IFC had 14 active country-specific advisory projects, of which six were already active in FY12. Of the 14 projects, five were closed with *successful* outcomes, two were put on hold, and seven were dropped or terminated. In addition, IFC had three regional programs in Africa that covered Mozambique but information on the amount allocated for Mozambique is not available. The project SME Management Solutions Africa was closed with *unsuccessful* development outcomes. The review could not confirm progress for the regional BAREC climate resilience program. The Sub-Sahara Africa Index Insurance program is building on the country-specific index-based weather and catastrophe insurance program for food and drought mentioned earlier; IEG validated this project and rated it *mostly successful*.

#### **Results Framework**

35. The results framework contained elements of a good framework. Broadly, it provides a logical chain: its objectives supported the achievement of the country's development goals by addressing critical constraints. It also established a link between objectives, Bank interventions, and results



indicators, most of them related to outcomes that could be associated with Bank interventions (but fewer to IFC interventions). Program indicators generally have baselines and targets, and the outcome indicators were generally appropriate to judge achievement of objectives, with some shortcomings. In several cases, outcome indicators did not sufficiently measure the program objectives or only part of the program objectives; or could not be fully attributable to the Bank's interventions. This is the case for objectives 1, 4, 9, 11, 15. Some objectives have multiple WBG interventions but the activities supported are not directly linked to the program objectives (For example, Objectives 3 and 11). Finally, IFC contributions were not always part of the results matrix.

#### Partnerships and Development Partner Coordination

36. The WBG worked closely with other development partners, leveraging IDA resources. The Bank coordinated its budget support operations (PRSCs) with other donors (G19), and convening a dialogue between donors and government. The Bank co-chaired with the UN a Development Partners Group which discusses policy issues and coordinates donor programs and project activities.

#### Safeguards and Fiduciary Issues

37. Compliance with Bank safeguard policies was generally satisfactory on the 11 investment projects that were closed and validated by IEG during the review period. The projects' ICRRs reported that the Bank adequately carried the due diligence requirements to ensure the social and environmental soundness of the operations. However, some shortcomings were noted including: missing details on implementation status of the environment and social frameworks by project closure, and the provision of insufficient evidence to fully validate social and environmental safeguards compliance (especially in the case of Education, Water, Agriculture, Urban Development and Trade and Competitiveness). In addition, ICR reviews noted inadequate application of the policy requirements for some of the triggered safeguards, and the Bank missed the opportunities to enforce best-practice standards. In other cases, mitigation challenges were raised and safeguards compliance was rated satisfactory with no reference of how the issues were resolved (mainly in Trade and Competitiveness).

38. On fiduciary issues, the Vice Presidency for Institutional Integrity (INT) received an unusually high number of complaints in the Education Sector projects in Mozambique during the CAS review period. The complaints related to a wide range of issues from procurement, financial management (FM) to embezzlement. None of the complaints were concrete enough to warrant an investigation, however the high number of complaints in this one sector does indicate that some underlying structural governance issues need to be addressed.

#### Ownership and Flexibility

39. The program covered areas identified in the government's poverty reduction program, and the authorities maintained their commitment to its program and to the strategy agreed with the Bank. For the second time, the WBG did not undertake a Performance Learning Review which was a missed opportunity to revisit the original CPS and its underlying assumptions to adapt to the changing country context.

## WBG Internal Cooperation

40. The Bank and IFC prepared a joint CPS with their programs seeking to complement each other's activities. The joint efforts were reflected in Pillars I and II. In Pillar I, WBG cooperated on the regulatory environment which touched on matters of investment climate, capacity building and access to credit for small and medium enterprises (Objective 1), and tourism (Objective 4). The CLR does not report separately on IFC but refers to its interventions when discussing achievement of objectives. IFC interventions were not always part of the results matrix.

#### Risk Identification and Mitigation

41. The CPS identified the following risks for the program: reduced donor aid, elevated social tensions, especially among urban unemployed youth, macroeconomic shocks and their impact on the Government's reform program, and weak government capacity to coordinate and implement cross



sectoral reforms and operations and to manage the extractive industry sector, including private sector participation. The CLR reports that all the risks materialized and the Bank's response was generally effective. The CLR does not report on what the Bank did to mitigate the risks, except for the impact of floods in early 2014, where the Bank provided emergency financing from the crisis response window.

#### **Overall Assessment and Rating**

42. IEG assesses overall WBG performance as *fair*. On <u>design</u>, the WBG selected objectives that supported the government's development plan, and it chose appropriate interventions to deliver the program and achieve the objectives in most instances. Although most of the objectives had substantial relevance, it could have been more focused for greater impact. Moreover, some program objectives were associated with several interventions but the activities they supported were not directly related to the program's objectives and the expected results. The results framework had the elements of a good framework: broadly, there was a clear link between objectives, Bank interventions, and results indicators related to outcomes associated with the interventions. But it had shortcomings: the results matrix was fragmented with 17 objectives and 30 outcome indicators, some indicators do not sufficiently measure achievement of the program objectives, and IFC interventions were not always part of the results matrix.

43. On <u>implementation</u>, the WBG increased its reliance on the country's financial management systems: now state and municipal budgets include Bank funds and the Administrative Tribunal (Tribunal Administrativo) can audit Bank-financed projects. The CPS identified the risks to the program and the CLR reports that all of them materialized. In the case of reduced donor aid and negative external shocks, the Bank stepped up its financial support with additional \$477 million in credits. As in previous CPS, the WBG did not undertake a performance learning review, which was a missed opportunity for mid-course corrections. According to the CLR, management could have assumed greater leadership roles and engaged more with development partners and senior government officials on substantive issues, and paid more attention to maintaining the local office with sufficient international staff, and monitoring the local and institutional context to prevent delays in project implementation. On safeguards, compliance with Bank safeguards policies was generally satisfactory but there were some shortcomings. On fiduciary issues, there was an unusually high number of complaints in the education sector. Although none of the complaints were investigated, the high number of complaints indicate some underlying structural governance issues.

## 7. Assessment of CLR Completion Report

44. The CLR follows the CPS results framework, presents evidence listed in the results matrix, and introduces additional results indicators. The CLR is candid and assesses reasonably well the design and implementation of the program, but could have analyzed in more depth the quality of the results chain. The CLR does not explain how the WBG dealt with safeguards and fiduciary issues. Its review of IFC's portfolio is meager, at best, overlooking several mining projects, and some of the discussion seems to be misplaced (e.g., manufacturing industries in the agriculture section). For instance, it could have highlighted IFC's closer cooperation with the World Bank and other development partners in agriculture and forestry. In summary, the CLR describes well the program and its implementation performance, but in some instances its assessment of results is overly optimistic.

## 8. Findings and Lessons

45. IEG concurs with the CLR findings, lessons and recommendations: (i) the need for the Bank to assume strategic leadership on substantive issues with donor partners and government; and proactive management of the WBG program, including maintaining stable international staff in the field; (ii) consolidation and better integration of Bank's portfolio for greater impact; and (iii) strengthening the Bank's political economy and institutional assessments to inform project design and implementation, and aligning Bank's program ambition with the country's implementation capacity.



#### 46. IEG adds the following lessons:

- With limited program envelope and implementation capacity constraints at the country level, the Bank could focus more on limited and strategic interventions, building on its comparative advantage and ensuring sustained management attention and engagement during program implementation.
- Better alignment of program interventions with program objectives are critical to enhance program effectiveness and impact. In the case of Mozambique, some objectives have multiple interventions that did not directly contribute to program objectives and outcomes. Hence there is need for greater selectivity in the choice of interventions to achieve results.
- IFC's contributions including alignment to the WBG program and would need to be better articulated and reflected in the program results framework.



Annex Table 1: Summary of Achievements of CPS Objectives

Annex Table 2: Mozambique Planned and Actual Lending, FY12-16

Annex Table 3: Analytical and Advisory Work for Mozambique, FY12 - FY16

Annex Table 4: Mozambique Grants and Trust Funds Active in FY12-15 (\$M)

Annex Table 5: IEG Project Ratings for Mozambique, FY12-FY16

Annex Table 6: IEG Project Ratings for Mozambique and Comparators, FY12-FY16

Annex Table 7: Portfolio Status for Mozambique and Comparators, FY12-16

Annex Table 8: Disbursement Ratio for Mozambique, FY12-16

Annex Table 9: Net Disbursement and Charges for Mozambique, FY12-15

Annex Table 10: Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid for Mozambique

Annex Table 11: Economic and Social Indicators for Mozambique, 2012 – 2015

Annex Table 12: List of IFC Investments in Mozambique - Investments Committed in FY12-FY16

Annex Table 13: List of IFC Advisory Services for Mozambique

Annex Table 14: IFC Net Commitment Activity for Mozambique

Annex Table 15: List of MIGA Activities in Mozambique



# Annex Table 1: Summary of Achievements of CPS Objectives

	CPS FY12-FY15 – Focus Area 1: Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results (as of current month and year)	IEG Comments
	1. CPS Objective: Improved reg	ulatory environment in targeted areas (Mo	ostly Achieved)
	Indicator: Number of days to issue industrial and commercial licenses reduced by 30 percent from 2010 to 2013, 50% to 2015 Baseline: No (2012) Target: Yes (2015)	Commercial Licenses The baseline in 2010 was 22 days; actual as of May 2015 is 7 days, equivalent to a 68% reduction. Industrial Licenses The baseline in 2010 was 32 days; actual as of May 2015 is 13 days, equivalent to a 59% reduction. Achieved	Source: CLR and Competitiveness and Private Sector Development (P106355), Approved FY09, IEG: S Baselines were provided ex post at the CLR stage.
	Indicator: Number of days to clear imports and exports Baseline: Imports = 32 (2009); exports = 26 (2009) Target: Imports = 16 (2009); exports = 13 (2009)	Imports As of May 2015, the number of days to import had been reduced from 32 to 25 (reduction of 22% - achieving approx. 44% of target of 16 days). Exports As of May 2015, the number of days to export reduced from 26 to 21 (reduction of approx. 20% - achieving 38% of target). Partially achieved	Source: CLR and P106355 ISR Sequence 12 (June 2015). Competitiveness and Private Sector Development (P106355). Approved FY09. Management assessment: S
<u>Major</u>		nagement of development process throug	h spatial planning (Not Achieved)
<u>Outcome</u> <u>Measures</u>	Indicator: Number of Spatial Development Initiatives (SDIs) adopted for feasibility by government, private sector, and/or PPPs Baseline: 0 (2010) Target: 20 (2015) Indicator: Number of projects identified with high employment generation for youth and women per each spatial development initiative Baseline: 0 (2010) Target: 20 (2015)	The CPS proposed indicators were not achieved owing to delays in the implementation of the Spatial Development Planning TA Project (FY11). As of June 2015, only one SDI for Maputo had been completed and approved. <b>Not achieved</b>	Source: CLR, ISR Spatial Development Planning Technical Assistance Project (P121398). Approved FY11. Management Assessment: MU In lieu of the program indicators, the CLR proposed to use as indicator the "establishment of a national spatial planning platform providing inter-agency and cross- sectoral coverage" <b>Baseline:</b> No (2010) <b>Target:</b> Yes (2015) Because the indicator was achieved, the CLR rates the
			achievement of the objective as "partially achieved". IEG rates achievement based on the program indicators. For this objective, the program indicator was not achieved.
		yields and overall productivity in target a	
	Indicator: Number of tons of (i) potatoes and (ii) tomatoes per hectare	Progress towards this target was supported through the Market led Smallholder Development in the Zambezi	Source: CLR, ISR#8



CPS FY12-FY15 – Focus Area 1: Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results (as of current month and year)	IEG Comments
Baseline: (i) 10 (2010); (ii) 18 (2010) Target: (i) 15 (2015); (ii) 23 (2015)	<ul> <li>Valley (P093165) (<u>IEG: MS</u>) and PROIRRI Sustainable Irrigation Development (P107598) (<u>Management</u> <u>assessment: MS</u>).</li> <li>(i) October 2015: 18 tons of potatoes per hectare (<u>P107598 ISR Sequence 8</u>).</li> <li>(ii) October 2015: 16 tons of tomatoes per hectare (<u>P107598 ISR Sequence 8</u>).</li> <li><b>Mostly Achieved</b></li> </ul>	
Indicator: Number of additional smallholders with access to finance to help develop value chains Baseline: 0 (2011) Target: 8,000, of which 33% are women (2015)	Progress towards this target was supported through PROIRRI Sustainable Irrigation Development (P107598) ( <u>Management assessment: MS</u> ). As of October 2015, the number of beneficiaries' subprojects approved 2,210 ( <u>P107598 ISR Sequence 8</u> ). The management assessment is not clear with respect to the percentage of women within the approved subprojects. The CLR reports does not report on the gender dimension of the target either. <b>Partially Achieved</b>	Source: CLR ISR#8
4. CPS Objective: Increased em Achieved)	ployment and growth in targeted areas of	the tourism sector (Mostly
Indicator: Number of local residents employed, formally and informally, in conservation and tourism in targeted districts Baseline: 1,300 in 2010 Target: 2,800 by 2015	Progress towards this target was supported through the Transfrontier Conservation Areas and Tourism Development Project (P071465) ( <u>IEG:</u> <u>S</u> ). As of June 2014, the number of local people employed, formally and informally, in conservation and tourism in targeted areas reached 2027 in June 2014. Employment in the tourism sector depends on the demand for accommodation services; therefore, only the number of bed-nights should be considered. Using the two indicators counts the same benefit twice and gives the false impression of the project having a larger impact than it does. For this reason, the CLR does not rate the achievement of this indicator. <b>Achieved</b>	Source: CLR, ISR
Indicator: Number of bed-nights in tourism facilities in the target districts	Progress towards this target was supported through the Transfrontier Conservation Areas and Tourism Development Project (P071465) ( <u>IEG:</u>	Source: CLR, ISR



CPS FY12-FY15 – Focus Area 1: Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results (as of current month and year)	IEG Comments
	nights in tourism facilities in the target districts was 196,000. <b>Mostly Achieved</b>	
5. CPS Objective: Improved pro	bvision and management of road infrastru	cture (Mostly Achieved)
Indicator: Share of total classified roads in good and fair condition Baseline: 69.3% (2012) Target: 73% (2016)	The share of total classified roads in good and fair condition declined from 69.3% in 2012 to 68% in December 2015. The CLR reports that bad weather (cyclones and flooding) has generated a cycle of improved and deteriorated road conditions between 2012 and 2015, but the percentages of roads in good and fair condition never reached the target of 78 percent set for 2012. <b>Not achieved</b>	Source: CLR The CPS lacked a CPSPR and, fo this reason, the country team missed the opportunity to update the results framework. The baseline and target were updated at the CLR stage. The original baseline was 75% (2010) and the original target 78% (2012). Mozambique -Roads and Bridges Management and Maintenance Program - Phase II (P083325). Approved FY07. Management assessment: S
Indicator: Share of rural population with access (within 2km) to an all-season road Baseline: 31.8% (2010) Target: 32.3% (2012)	As of December 2012, the share of the population with access to all season roads had increased to 32.7% and, as of December 2014, it had increased to 34.2% (ISR Sequence 17). Achieved	Source: CLR and P115217 ISR Sequence 10 (June 2015). Maputo Municipal Development Program II (MMDP II) (P115217). Approved FY11. Management assessment: MS
Indicator: Number of people in Maputo municipality with access (within 500 meters) to all-season roads Baseline: 60,000 (2011) Target: 300,000 (2015)	The CLR reports that, by December 2014, a total number of 416,250 people in Maputo benefitted from all-season roads. As of April 2015, a total number of 588,975 people benefitted from all- season roads corresponding to the rehabilitation of 157 km (ISN Sequence 10). Achieved	Source: CLR and P115217 ISR Sequence 10 (June 2015). Maputo Municipal Development Program II (MMDP II) (P115217). Approved FY11. Management assessment: MS The CLR reported figures do not match the figures in the ISN Sequence 10 for the Maputo Municipal Development Program II (MMDP II) (P115217). This was the last ISN produced within the CPS period.
	ovision of water and sanitation service (Ac	
Indicator: Number of people in urban areas provided with access to improved Water Source under the project Baseline: 192,443 (2011) Target: 292,118 (out of which 50% are women) (2015)	As of March 2015, 795,508 people in urban areas had been provided with access to Improved Water Sources (out of which 50% were women). Achieved	Source: CLR and P104566 IEG: S Water Services and Institutional Support Project (P104566). Approved FY08. IEG: S
Indicator: Number of people in Maputo municipality with access to regular solid waste collection services	During Maputo's Municipal Development Program, the number of people in urban areas provided with access to regular solid waste collection increased from	Source: CLR and P115217 ISR Sequence 10 (June 2015). Maputo Municipal Development Program II (MMDP II) (P115217).



CPS FY12-FY15 – Foo Competitiveness Employmen	s and (as of current mont)	IEC: Commonte
Baseline: 729,264 (207 Target: 1,041,545 (201	10) 729,264 in 2010 to 1,130,	109 by June Approved FY11. Management assessment: MS
7. CPS Objective: Ir	nproved access to electricity (Not acl	nieved)
Indicator: Number of p peri-urban and rural are access to electricity. Baseline: 42,500 hous connections (2010)	eas with owing to delays in the im the Energy Development	Inplementation of nt and AccessSequence 12 (December 2016).4). The closingEnergy Development and Access
connections (2010) <b>Target:</b> 67,500 househ connections (2015)		Management assessment: MS.
Indicator: Number of re clinics and schools with	access to owing to delays in the imp	plementation of
electricity. Baseline: Rural health 150 (2010); Rural schor (2010) Target: Rural health cli 2017; Rural schools: 40	ols: 150 date was extended from June 2017) nics: 400 <b>Not achieved</b>	I). The closing Project (APL-2) (P108444).
8. CPS Objective: Ir	nproved access to affordable telecom	
Indicator: Price of broa Internet Access [1Mbps Baseline: \$90 (2010) Target: \$30 (2015)	adband The CLR does not report	on the originally indicator was R stage. In lieu he CLR reports a monthly ubscription fell er 2010) to 114). sers subscribe per month for ng 1Mbps ger subscriptionSource: CLR, Regional e- government and communications infrastructure (FY09) The CPS lacked a CPSPR and, for this reason, the country team missed the opportunity to revise indicators that were no longer appropriate. The indicator was revised at the CLR stage.om/en/list-of-all-om/en/list-of-all-
Indicator: Share of gra		
targeted TVET program / create jobs in related t 6 months of graduation Baseline: 27.2% (2007 Target: 60% (2015)	ns that find graduates trained in the n fields within had found a job/created directly related to their fiel	ew methodology MS a job that was Technical and Vocational d of study within Education and Training (P087347)
Indicator: Transition ra higher primary level (EF next level post primary Baseline: 79% (2010)		t level post Sequence 8 (March 2015). 9% in 2010 to



CPS FY12-FY15 – Focus Area 1: Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results (as of current month and year)	IEG Comments
Target: 90% (2015)	to judge program results in a country where the primary completion rate is low and has remained unchanged for several years <b>Achieved</b>	Education Sector Support Program (P125127). Approved FY11. Management assessment: MS
Indicator: Number of students graduating from higher education institutions Baseline: 7,000 (2010) Target: 9,100 (2015)	The number of graduates from higher education increased from 7000 in 2008 to 10,929 in 2014. <b>Achieved</b>	Source: CLR, ISR Higher Education Science and Technology (P111592). Approved FY10. Management assessment: S

	CPS FY12-FY15 – Focus Area 2:	Actual Results	IEG Comments
	Vulnerability and Resilience	(as of current month and year)	
		Ith services for the vulnerable (Mostly Ac	
<u>Major</u> <u>Outcome</u> <u>Measures</u>	Indicator: Share of institutional deliveries in 3 Northern provinces (Cabo Delgado, Nampula and Niassa) increases from 62% in 2010 to 72% in 2015 Baseline: 62% (2010) Target: 72% in 2015	Overall Results Three Northern Provinces As of December 2014, the percentage of institutional deliveries was 81.2% (P099930 – ISR Sequence 14 – April 2015). <u>Cabo Delgado</u> As of December 2014, the percentage of institutional deliveries was 76% (P099930 – ISR Sequence 14 – April 2015). <u>Nampula</u> As of December 2014, the percentage of institutional deliveries was 82% (P099930 – ISR Sequence 14 – April 2015). <u>Namsula</u> As of December 2014, the percentage of institutional deliveries was 82% (P099930 – ISR Sequence 14 – April 2015). <u>Niassa</u> No information. <b>Mostly achieved</b>	Source: CLR and P099930 – ISR Sequence 14 (April 2015) Health Service Delivery (P099930). Approved in FY09. Management assessment: MS The ISR Sequence 13 (January 2015) lacks information on the Niassa province.
	Indicator: Number of adults and children with HIV receiving ARVs at the national level Baseline: 257,410 (2011) Target: 409,537 (out of which 68% female) (2015) Indicator: Children aged 6-23 months who received a minimum	As of December 2014, 585,544 persons were on Anti-Retroviral treatment (ART). As of June 2014, 129,405 129,405 adults and children living with HIV received ARVs (ICRR). The ISR and ICR do not report on the percentage of women receiving ARVs. <b>Achieved</b> The CLR reports that the roll out of the Nutrition Additional Financing (P125477)	Source: CLR and P121060 ICRR. Health Commodity Security Project (P121060). Approved in FY11. IEG: MS The figures reported in the CLR are different from the ones reported in the P121060 ISRs and ICR. Also, the CLR reporting lacks a breakdown by gender. Source: CLR Nutrition Additional Financing
	acceptable diet at the national level Baseline: 37% (2010) Target: 60% (2010)	has experienced delays and, for this reason, the target has not been met. <b>Not Achieved</b>	(P125477). Approved FY13.



CPS FY12-FY15 – Focus Area 2:	Actual Results	IEG Comments
Vulnerability and Resilience	(as of current month and year)	<u> </u>
	climate change and reduced the risk of r	
Indicator: Accurate weather information system available to stakeholders in 70% of Central and Southern regions on at least a 12-hour basis Baseline: No (2012) Target: Yes (2015)	The CLR reports that weather radars covering part of the south and central region have been calibrated, thus allowing for more precise and immediate warnings of extreme events to be issued by end 2013. The radars have been acquired but are not fully functional. The technical assistance support and purchase of additional meteorological equipment is underway and outcomes should be achieved by December 2016 <b>Not Achieved</b>	Source: CLR Mozambique-Programmatic Support to Disaster Risk Management Phase I (P124755). Approved FY11. Management assessment: Not available.
12. CPS Objective: Strengthened		l
Indicator: Number of vulnerable people benefiting from effective social safety net program Baseline: 80,000 (2011) Target: 815,000 (2015)	The target included in the CPS results matrix related to the national program and, thus, it is well beyond what can be attributed to the Bank. The credit for social protection had disbursed \$6.83 million by September 2016, and about 23 thousand of the 100 thousand beneficiaries had been reached. <b>Not Achieved</b>	Source: CLR, ISR#6 (Sept. 2016) Preparation and Supervision of the Pilot Public Works Program (P124216). Approved FY12. Management assessment: Not available. The CPS lacked a CPSPR and, fo this reason, the country team missed the opportunity to revise indicators that were no longer appropriate. Two new indicator were proposed at the CLR stage. <u>They were:</u> (i) Targeting approaches across GoM's core social safety programs unified; (ii) single registry of social security beneficiaries unified. <b>Baseline:</b> (i) No (2012); (ii) No (2012) <b>Target:</b> (i) Yes (2015); (ii) Yes (2015). Both of the new targets achieved.

	CPS FY12-FY15 – Focus Area 3: Governance and Public Sector Capacity	Actual Results (as of current month and year)	IEG Comments	
	13. CPS Objective Improved publ	ic financial management (Not Achieved)		
<u>Major</u> <u>Outcome</u> <u>Measures</u>	Indicator: (i) PEFA (PI.12) rating; (ii) PEFA (PI.26) rating; (iii) PEFA (PI.1 and PI.2) rating Baseline: (i) C+ (2009); (ii) C+ (2009); (iii) C (2009) Target: (i) B (2013); (ii) B (2013); (iii) B (2013)	PEFA (PI.12) Rating has remained unchanged at C+ PEFA (PI.26) Rating has remained unchanged at C+ PEFA (PI.1 and PI.2) There was no improvement under PI.1 and, progress cannot be assessed under PI2 because the results of the	Source: CLR, PEFA (2015) PI-12 measures multi-year perspective in fiscal planning, expenditure policy and budgeting. PI.26 measures scope, nature and follow-up of external audit	



CPS FY12-FY15 – Focus Area 3: Governance and Public Sector Capacity	Actual Results (as of current month and year)	IEG Comments
	2010 and 2015 for this indicator cannot be compared. s. <b>Not Achieved</b>	PI.1 measures aggregate expenditure out-turn compared to original approved budget PI.2 measures composition of expenditure out-turn compared to original approved budget The latest PEFA assessment (2015) shows that between 2010 and 2015 the ranking of public financial management indicators changed as follows: A fell from 6 to 5 B or B+ remained unchanged at 10 C or C+ fell from 9 to 8 D or D+ increased from 3 to 5
Indicator: Percentage of state investment expenditure processed through open competitive bidding Baseline: 15% (2011) Target: ≥ 65% (2015)	Dropped as the intervention supporting the achievement of the indicator were no longer part of the Bank program. Not Verified (Dropped)	Source: CLR
	city of local administration to manage	
Indicator: Number of districts with more than 90% budget execution of their district operational plan and budget Baseline: 85 (2009) Target: 105 (2013) and 110 (2015)	As of June 2015, the number of districts with more than 90% budget execution of their district operational plan was 110 (P107311 ICR). However, as of September 2013, this number was 63 (P107311 – ISR Sequence 7 – February 2014). Achieved	Source: CLR, P107311 ICR and P107311 – ISR Sequence 7 (February 2014) National Decentralized Planning and Finance Program (P107311). Approved FY10. Management assessment: MS.
15. CPS Objective: Improved citize	en participation in public service monit	oring (Not Achieved)
Indicator: Mean user perception of quality of public services in Maputo municipality, as reported in the citizen Municipal Report Card, remains at 2.8 (0-5 scale) from 2011 to 2013, and reaches 3.0 in 2015 Baseline: No (2011) Target: Yes (2015)	The mean user perception of quality of public services in Maputo municipality is based on the Results from the Citizen Report Card which is annually conducted in June. The latest value from November 2014 is 2.7. The next Municipal Citizens Report Card exercise is scheduled for September 2015. <b>Not Achieved</b>	Source: CLR and P115217 ISR Sequence 11 (December 2015). Maputo Municipal Development Program II (MMDP II) (P115217). Approved FY11. Management assessment: MS. The most recent ISR for the Maputo project (Sequence 13, December 8, 2016) notes that the indicator on improvement in perception "will probably not be achieved"
·	oution of wildlife conservation to econo	
Indicator: Bio-indicator species (2 species / area) in Maputo Special Reserve, Zinave National Park, Banhine National Park and Chimanimani Reserve continues to increase about 1% per year from 2011 to 2015	(i) Maputo Special Reserve The CLR reports that the elephant and zebra population increased 197% and 93% between 2006 and 2012. According to the P071465 ISR Sequence 19 (June 2014), elephant increased by 37% between 2006 and	Source: CLR and P071465 ISR Sequence 19 (June 2014) Transfrontier Conservation Areas and Tourism Development Project (P071465). Approved FY06. IEG: S The indicator refers to an increase between 2011 and 2015. However,



CPS FY12-FY15 – Focus Area 3: Governance and Public Sector Capacity	Actual Results (as of current month and year)	IEG Comments		
Target: Yes	2013. No information is provided on zebras. (ii) Zinave National Park According to the CLR, impala and nyala increased by 204% and 81% respectively between 2006 and 2012. According to the P071465 ISR Sequence 19 (June 2014), impala and nyala increased by 219% and 73% respectively between 2009 and 2013. (iii) Banhine National Park According to the CLR, oribi and ostrich increased by 682% and 150% respectively between 2006 and 2012. According to the P071465 ISR Sequence 19 (June 2014), oribi and ostrich increased by 682% and 147% respectively between 2006 and 2013. (iv) Chimanimani Reserve According to the CLR, duiker and sable increased by 186% and 250% respectively between 2006 and 2012. According to the P071465 ISR Sequence 19 (June 2014), duiker and sable increased by 186% and 250% respectively between 2006 and 2012. According to the P071465 ISR Sequence 19 (June 2014), duiker and sable increased by 189% and 254% between 2006 and 2013. <b>Achieved</b>	the CLR reports only between 2006 and 2012. There are discrepancies between the figures reported in the CLR and the latest available ISR for the P071465 project (i.e. Sequence 19).		
	sparency in extractive industries (Achie			
Indicator: Mozambique achieves and maintains EITI compliant status from the International EITI Board Baseline: No (2011) Target: Yes (2015)	Mozambique was EITI compliant since 2013 and issues reports annually. Achieved	Source: CLR, EITI website Mozambique: Extractive Industries- Technical Advisory Facility (P126354). Approved FY12 Mozambique Phase II: EITI Implementation (P127115). Approved FY12		



## Annex Table 2: Mozambique Planned and Actual Lending, FY12-16

Project ID	Project name	Proposed FY	Approva I FY	Closin g FY	Proposed Amount	Approved Amount	Outcome Rating
Project Plan	ned Under CPS 2012-15						<u>.</u>
P107350	Water Resource Development	2012	2012	2018		70.0	LIR: MS
P125283	Technical and Vocational AF	2012	2012			37.0	No Rating
P123201	Cities and Climate Change	2012	2012	2018		120.0	LIR: MS
P126226	PRSC 8	2012	2012	2013		110.0	No Rating
	Total FY12					337.0	
P127303	Integrated Growth Poles Project	2013	2013	2020		100.0	LIR: MU
P146402	Road and Bridges Management and Maintenance III	2013	2014	2018		39.4	LIR: S
P129847	Mining and Gas TA	2013	2013	2020		50.0	LIR: S
P129489	Agricultural Productivity DPO	2013	2013	2014		50.0	LIR: MS
DROPPED	Early Childhood Development	2013		<u>.</u>			
????	CESUL Regional Transmission	2013				-	
P129524	Social Protection Program	2013	2013	2018		50.0	LIR: MS
P128434	Climate Change DPO	2013	2013	2013		50.0	LIR: S
P125477	Nutrition program AF	2013	2013	·····		37.0	No Rating
P124615	P4R in Economic Governance	2013	2014	2018		50.0	LIR: MS
P131212	PRSC 9	2013	2014	2014		110.0	LIR: S
	Total FY13					536.4	
P125120	Greater Maputo Water Supply	2014	2014	2020		178.0	LIR: S
DROPPED	Transfrontier Conservation Area II	2014					
DROPPED	Fisheries and Coastal Livelihoods	2014		·			
DROPPED	Peri-urban Water Supply	2014		4			
????	Regional Agricultural Productivity	2014					
P146930	Agricultural Productivity DPO	2014	2015	2016		50.0	No Rating
P146537	PRSC 10	2014	2015	2015		110.0	LIR: MS
	Total FY14					338.0	
DROPPED	Agricultural Productivity DPO	2015					<u>.</u>
DROPPED	PRSC 11	2015					
P146398	Climate Change DPO 2	2015	2015	2015		50.0	LIR: S
	Total FY15					50.0	<u>.</u>
P149377	Water Service & Institutional Support II		2016	2023		90.0	No Rating
P149620	MZ-Agriculture NRM Project		2016	2022		40.0	No Rating
P151185	AF to Education Sector Support Project		2016	<u> </u>		50.0	No Rating
P151861	Financial Sector DPL II		2016	2016		25.0	No Rating
P154422	Mozambique PRSC XI		2016	2017		70.0	No Rating
P156559	MZ - Emergency Recovery Project		2016	2019		40.0	No Rating



Project ID	Project name	Proposed FY	Approva I FY	Closin g FY	Proposed Amount	Approved Amount	Outcome Rating
P157598	Training and Education for Tribunal Adm		2016	2019		0.0	No Rating
	Total FY16					315.0	
	Total Planned					1261.4	
Unplanned	Projects during the CPS Period						
P124729	MZ-AFto Education Sector Support Project		2012			40.0	LIR: MS
P146098	Water Resources Dev I Flood Response AF		2014			32.0	LIR: MS
P150956	Third Additional Financing to RBMMP2-AF3	•	2015			73.6	LIR: S
P146602	Addl Fin for Higher Educ Science and Tec		2015			45.0	LIR: S
P131965	MozBio Program - Phase 1		2015	2019		40.0	LIR: MS
P133687	Financial Sector DPL		2015	2015		25.0	LIR: S
	Total Unplanned					255.6	
On-going P	rojects during the CPS Period		Approva I FY	Closin g FY		Approved Amount	
P107598	MZ-PROIRRI Sustainable Irrigation Dev.		2011	2017		70.0	LIR: MS
P114880	MZ:APL2 Roads & Bridges - 1st Addl Finan		2011			41.0	N/A
P115217	MZ-Maputo Municipal Development Prog II		2011	2016		50.0	LIR: MS
P121060	MZ-Health Commodity Security Project		2011	2014		39.0	IEG: MS
P121398	MZ-Spatial Development Planning TA		2011	2016		20.0	LIR: MU
P125127	MZ-Education Sector Support Program		2011	2019		71.0	LIR: MS
P107311	MZ-Nat'l Dec Planning & Fin SIL (FY10)		2010	2015		30.4	LIR: MS
P108444	MZ-Energy Dev. & Access Project (APL-2)		2010	2017		80.0	LIR: MS
P111592	MZ Higher Educ Science & Techn. (FY10)		2010	2019		40.0	LIR: S
P099930	MZ-Health Service Delivery SIL (FY09)		2009	2017		44.6	LIR: MS
P106355	MZ-Competitiveness & PS Dev		2009	2016		25.0	LIR: S
P084404	MZ- Transmission Upgrade		2008	2016		93.0	LIR: MS
P104566	MZ-Water Services & Inst. Support		2008	2016		15.0	LIR: S
P083325	MZ-APL2 Roads & Bridges		2007	2018		100.0	LIR: S
P096332	MZ-Maputo Municipal Development Program		2007	2012		30.0	IEG: S
P071465	MZ-TFCA & Tourism Dev (FY06)		2006	2014		20.0	IEG: S
P086169	MZ-Financial Sector TA Project		2006	2012		10.5	IEG: MS
P087347	MZ Tech & Voc Edu & Training (FY06)	**************************************	2006	2016		30.0	LIR: MS
P093165	MZ-Market Led Smallholder Dev (FY06)	\$ 	2006	2014		20.0	IEG: MS
P082618	MZ-Beira Railway SIL (FY05)		2005	2012		110.0	IEG: U
	Total On-going					939.5	

Source: Mozambique CPS and AO table 2a.1, 2a.4 and 2a.7 as of 1/7/16

\*LIR: Latest internal rating. MU: Moderately Unsatisfactory. MS: Moderately Satisfactory. S: Satisfactory. HS: Highly Satisfactory.

\*\* Regional Projects not included on this table \*\*\* NR: No rating. Latest ISR not available



# Annex Table 3: Analytical and Advisory Work for Mozambique, FY12 - FY16

Proj ID	Economic and Sector Work	Fiscal year	Output Type
P123282	MZ Financial Sector Development Strategy	FY12	Not assigned
P123405	Mz-Growth and Fiscal Space	FY12	Not assigned
P127831	MTDS Follow Up - Mozambique	FY12	Debt management Performance Assessment(DeMPA)
P129626	Prioritizing INF Investment Spatial Lens	FY13	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P132610	Cultural Heritage Sustainable Tourism	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P130463	Mozambique Public Expenditure Review	FY15	Public Expenditure Review (PER)
P143053	MZ Governance	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P151635	Policy Notes New Government	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P145456	Mozambique Service Delivery Indicators	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P148554	Health and Development in Mozambique	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P152677	Mozambique Energy Sector Policy Work	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P152702	Program. Poverty and Employment Analysis	FY16	Other Poverty Study
P152901	Teachers Capacity and Accountability	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
Proj ID	Technical Assistance	Fiscal year	Output Type
P104447	MZ-GFDRR Mainstreaming Disaster (FY12)	FY12	Technical Assistance
P111130	Resistance Monitoring & mapping for IRS	FY12	Technical Assistance
P122210	Mozambique Risk-Based Internal Audit	FY12	Technical Assistance
P123993	Mozambique El Value Chain TA	FY12	Technical Assistance
P124129	MZ - Social Protection Assessment	FY13	Technical Assistance
P127668	Mozambique Gas Master Plan and Policies	FY13	Technical Assistance
P116532	MZ-Participatory Budgeting	FY14	Technical Assistance
P127132	Mozambique #10170 Fin Sector Dev Strat	FY14	Technical Assistance
P131017	Follow-up on Country Procurement Systems	FY14	Technical Assistance
P133363	Institutional Review for Mining and Gas	FY14	Technical Assistance
P133429	RCIP Phase 3 TA	FY14	Technical Assistance
P143888	Mozambique financial capability survey	FY14	Technical Assistance
P117026	MZ: Russia Education Aid for Development	FY15	Technical Assistance
P126704	Mozambique Mining Sector Governance	FY15	Technical Assistance
P128770	MZ: Reforming the fisheries sector TA	FY15	Technical Assistance
P132006	AF/MZ/02 Peri-urban sanitation and water	FY15	Technical Assistance
P132023	AF/MZ/03 Sector Information System	FY15	Technical Assistance
P132131	CSO Mozambique: Cap Bldg under EITI	FY15	Technical Assistance
P143109	Ag. Sector Risk Assessment-Country 3	FY15	Technical Assistance
P147265	Poverty Statistics	FY15	Technical Assistance
P148656	Support procurement training Curriculum	FY15	Technical Assistance
P148657	Procurement System Review and Support	FY15	Technical Assistance
P151818	ZMM Growth Triangle Capacity Building	FY15	Technical Assistance
P128003	MZ Capacity Building for SOE Reform	FY16	Technical Assistance
P132005	AF/MZ/01 Rural and Town Water Supply	FY16	Technical Assistance
P147525	MZ Env and Social Capacity for El	FY16	Technical Assistance
P149134	Business Climate for Planted Forests	FY16	Technical Assistance
P150118	Mozambique#A041 Debt Markets Development	FY16	Technical Assistance
P150449	Enhanced Financial Management Practices	FY16	Technical Assistance
P151719	MZ Soc. &Env. Safg &Gend Perf.Port. Rev.	FY16	Technical Assistance
P153476	MZ Agriculture and Rural Development	FY16	Technical Assistance
1 1004/0		1110	



Proj ID	Economic and Sector Work	Fiscal year	Output Type
P153610	Mozambique #B042 Crisis Simulation	FY16	Technical Assistance
P155179	Approach towards Climate Change	FY16	Technical Assistance
P155440	Mozambique - Flood Rapid Assessment	FY16	Technical Assistance
P156291	Land and Community NRM NLTA	FY16	Technical Assistance

Source: WB AO ESW/TA 1.4 as of 3-6-17

## Annex Table 4: Mozambique Grants and Trust Funds Active in FY12-15 (\$M)

Project ID	Project name		Approval FY	Closing FY	Approved Amount	Outcome Rating
P151185			2016	2019	57,900,000	
P144551	AFCC2/RI Regional Transmission Interconnection between Mozambique and Malawi	TF 18537	2015	2017	3,600,000	
P132029	AFCC2/RI-South West Indian Ocean Fisheries Governance and Shared Growth Project 1	TF 19022	2015	2022	7,000,000	LIR: MS
P132597	Mozambique GEF Conservation Areas for Biodiversity and Development Project	TF 18239	2015	2019	6,319,635	LIR: MS
P149992	Mozambique - Artisanal Fisheries and Climate Change	TF 17403	2015	2019	3,177,746	
P149536	Building Gender-Sensitive SPL Systems	TF 17054	2015	2016	900,000	
P123201	Cities and Climate Change	TF 16486	2015	2019	6,500,000	LIR: MS
P123201	Cities and Climate Change	TF 16580	2015	2019	9,250,000	LIR: MS
P083325	Mozambique -Roads and Bridges Management and Maintenance Program - Phase II	TF 17375	2015	2016	15,381,749	LIR: S
P149629	Enhancing Spatial Data for Flood Risk Management Project	TF 17383	2014	2016	4,053,129	LIR: S
P149629	Enhancing Spatial Data for Flood Risk Management Project	TF 17384	2014	2016	4,902,095	
P147835	Social Accountability Knowledge, Skills, Action and Networking	TF 15860	2014	2019	700,000	
P130795	Mozambique Tourism Institutional Capacity Strengthening	TF 14715	2014	2017	748,720	
P145018	MZ Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative Post Compliance I	TF 15142	2014	2016	650,000	5
P132551	Mozambique - Maputo Peri-urban Sanitation	TF 13234	2014	2018	1,775,950	
P129847	Mozambique Mining and Gas Technical Assistance Project	TF 16113	2014	2019	8,664,911	LIR: S
P083325	Mozambique -Roads and Bridges Management and Maintenance Program - Phase II	TF 15923	2014	2017	6,500,000	LIR: S
P083325	Mozambique -Roads and Bridges Management and Maintenance Program - Phase II	TF 15898	2014	2017	9,250,000	
P131049	Climate Resilience: Transforming Hydro-Meteorological Services	TF 14031	2013	2019	15,000,000	LIR: S
P131195	Mozambique Climate Change Technical Assistance Project	TF 12431	2013	2017	2,000,000	
P107598	MZ PROIRRI Sustainable Irrigation Development	TF 10214	2013	2017	14,250,000	LIR: MS
P124216	MZ-Preparation and Supervision of the Pilot Public Works Program	TF 10612	2012	2013	1,800,000	
P125127	MZ-Education Sector Support Program	TF 99811	2012	2015	90,000,000	LIR: MS
P127820	Support for upgrading the Chamanculo C Neighborhood in accordance with the Global Strategy for URIS in Maputo Municipality	TF 10683	2012	2015	545,000	
P129413	MZ - FCPF REDD+ READINESS PREPARATION SUPPORT	TF 11206	2012	2017	3,800,000	



Project ID	Project name	TF ID	Approval FY	Closing FY	Approved Amount	Outcome Rating
P124732	AFSF - Africa - Mozambique - Banco Oportunidade - BOM	TF 11099	2012	2015	754,000	
P127115	Mozambique Phase II: EITI Implementation	TF 10226	2012	2013	350,000	
P126354	Mozambique: Extractive Industries-Technical Advisory Facility	TF 99766	2012	2014	750,000	
P124755	Mozambique-Programmatic Support to Disaster Risk Management Phase I	TF 99391	2011	2015	1,398,000	
P125225	Mozambique PPCR - Phase 1	TF 98872	2011	2014	1,500,000	
P116717	Capacity building of the Mozambique Supreme Audit Institution	TF 97535	2011	2015	446,250	
P108855	Mozambique: Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative Implementation	TF 96920	2011	2012	375,000	
P104566	Water Services and Institutional Support Project	TF 97281	2011	2015	16,990,800	LIR: S
P099930	Health Service Delivery	TF 96505	2010	2016	16,267,749	LIR: S
P099930	Health Service Delivery	TF 96375	2010	2014	7,862,000	
P099930	Health Service Delivery	TF 96399	2010	2016	4,052,721	
P116352	Strengthening M&E for PARPA III	TF 96135	2010	2013	499,805	
P150546	Mozambique - Community-Based Coastal Resource Management and Sustainable Livelihoods	TF 93663	2009	2015	1,853,000	
P114318	MOZAMBIQUE: Legal and Financial Advisory Services for Power Transmission System (EDM)	TF 92988	2009	2015	692,000	
P104945	Mozambique Water Private Sector Contracts - OBA for coverage expansion	TF 91213	2008	2014	6,000,000	LIR: S
P104566	Water Services and Institutional Support Project	TF 90410	2008	2013	15,000,000	IEG: S
P098040	Market-Led Smallholder Development in the Zambezi Valley	TF 91638	2008	2014	6,200,000	LIR: S
P087347	Technical and Vocational Education and Training	TF 56866	2006	2012	7,350,000	IEG: MS
P076809	Transfrontier Conservation Areas and Tourism Development Project	TF 56038	2006	2014	10,000,000	LIR: S
P071465	Transfrontier Conservation Areas and Tourism Development Project	TF 54759	2006	2014	3,720,000	
P071942	Mozambique: Energy Reform and Access Program	TF 52650	2004	2012	3,090,000	
	Total				379,820,260	

Source: Client Connection as of 01/6/16



## Annex Table 5: IEG Project Ratings for Mozambique, FY12-FY16

Exit FY	Proj ID	Project name	Total Evaluated (\$M)	IEG Outcome	IEG Risk to DO
2012	P082618	MZ-Beira Railway SIL (FY05)	112.9	UNSATISFACTORY	HIGH
2012	P086169	MZ-Financial Sector TA Project	9.6	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	NEGLIGIBLE TO LOW
2012	P096332	MZ-Maputo Municipal Development Program	29.3	SATISFACTORY	NEGLIGIBLE TO LOW
2012	P126226	Moz PRSC VIII	108.8	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2014	P071465	MZ-TFCA & Tourism Dev (FY06)	21.4	SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2014	P093165	MZ-Market Led Smallholder Dev (FY06)	20.1	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2014	P104945	GPOBA W3: Mozambique Water	0.0	SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2014	P121060	MZ-Health Commodity Security Project	36.3	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	NEGLIGIBLE TO LOW
2015	P107311	MZ-Nat'l Dec Planning & Fin SIL (FY10)	29.9	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2016	P087347	MZ Tech & Voc Edu & Training (FY06)	67.1	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2016	P104566	MZ-Water Services & Inst. Support	51.9	SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2016	P106355	MZ-Competitiveness & PS Dev	25.3	SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
		Total	512.6		

Source: AO Key IEG Ratings as of 3-6-17

## Annex Table 6: IEG Project Ratings for Mozambique and Comparators, FY12-FY16

Region	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (\$)	Outcome % Sat (No)	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (\$)	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (No)
Mozambique	512.9	12	74.1	83.3	53.9	58.3
AFR	17,881.5	368	73.9	66.8	41.3	34.0
World	100,417.5	1,202	82.9	71.0	59.6	45.5

Source: AO Table 4.a.5 as of 3-6-17

\* With IEG new methodology for evaluating projects, institutional development impact and sustainability are no longer rated separately



#### Annex Table 7: Portfolio Status for Mozambique and Comparators, FY12-16

Fiscal year	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	Average
Mozambique						
# Proj	29	33	33	32	29	31
# Proj At Risk	4	4	6	3	7	5
% Proj At Risk	13.8	12.1	18.2	9.4		13.4
Net Comm Amt	1,121.3	1,409.7	1,507.2	1,682.3	1,752.1	1,494.5
Comm At Risk	256.6	282.0	347.5	283.6	354.3	304.8
% Commit at Risk	22.9	20.0	23.1	16.9	20.2	20.6
AFR						
# Proj	627	566	620	643	659	623
# Proj At Risk	127	128	138	136	144	135
% Proj At Risk	20.3	22.6	22.3	21.2	21.9	21.6
Net Comm Amt	40,416.8	42,649.1	49,142.6	54,586.3	59,033.9	49,165.7
Comm At Risk	6,504.6	14,310.8	16,548.2	16,000.3	18,949.8	14,462.7
% Commit at Risk	16.1	33.6	33.7	29.3	32.1	29.0
World						
# Proj	2,029	1,964	2,048	2,022	1,975	2,008
# Proj At Risk	387	414	412	444	422	416
% Proj At Risk	19.1	21.1	20.1	22.0	21.4	20.7
Net Comm Amt	173,706.1	176,202.6	192,610.1	201,045.2	220,331.5	192,779.1
Comm At Risk	24,465.0	40,805.6	40,933.5	45,987.7	44,244.9	39,287.3
% Commit at Risk	14.1	23.2	21.3	22.9	20.1	20.3

Source: AO Table 3a.4 as of 3/6/17

## Annex Table 8: Disbursement Ratio for Mozambique, FY12-16

Fiscal Year	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	Overall Result
Mozambique						
Disbursement Ratio (%)	21.1	19.1	20.7	21.3	25.1	21.5
Inv Disb in FY	145.3	150.9	187.8	174.9	200.2	859.1
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	687.4	790.0	907.5	821.9	798.1	4,004.9
AFR						
Disbursement Ratio (%)	21.4	22.5	23.1	24.5	19.6	22.2
Inv Disb in FY	5,260.3	5,652.1	6,143.9	6,473.2	5,572.5	29,102.1
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	24,595.0	25,175.9	26,540.4	26,463.6	28,377.1	131,152.0
World						
Disbursement Ratio (%)	20.8	20.6	20.8	21.8	19.5	20.7
Inv Disb in FY	21,048.2	20,510.7	20,757.7	21,851.3	21,149.6	105,317.6
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	101,234.3	99,588.3	99,854.3	100,336.7	108,594.4	509,608.0

\* Calculated as IBRD/IDA Disbursements in FY / Opening Undisbursed Amount at FY. Restricted to Lending Instrument Type = Investment. Source: AO Table 3.a.12 as of 3/6/17



## Annex Table 9: Net Disbursement and Charges for Mozambique, FY12-15

Period	Disb. Amt.	Repay Amt.	Net Amt.	Charges	Fees	Net Transfer
Jul 2011 - Jun 2012	248,163,205	9,867,859	238,295,346	-	12,258,853	226,036,493
Jul 2012 - Jun 2013	202,448,466	10,851,191	191,597,274	-	13,110,935	
Jul 2013 - Jun 2014	352,811,499	11,487,952	341,323,547	-	15,186,852	326,136,696
Jul 2014 - Jun 2015	361,942,441	14,841,218	347,101,223		16,445,165	330,656,058
Report Total	1,165,365,611	47,048,220	1,118,317,391	-	57,001,805	882,829,247

Source: World Bank Client Connection 1/6/16

#### Annex Table 10: Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid for Mozambique

Development Partners	2012	2013	2014
Australia	16.09	11.08	4.44
Austria	8.74	6.77	7.08
Belgium	11.87	30.9	21.08
Canada	123.43	107.74	75.68
Czech Republic	0.01		
Denmark	78.8	88.63	57.41
Finland	39.49	28.88	28.49
France	21.99	32.72	71.99
Germany	60.35	62.71	77.51
Iceland	2.31	2.88	2.75
Ireland	52.8	55.25	53.27
Italy	22.36	22.25	23.66
Japan	70.3	98.37	85.28
Korea	25.13	57.08	56.51
Luxembourg	0.1		
Netherlands	53.71	62.3	47.67
New Zealand	0.1	0.16	
Norway	86.11	50.74	57.25
Poland	0.01		
Portugal	80.24	66.93	53.41
Spain	17.87	19.31	11.43
Sweden	114.71	136.02	119.17
Switzerland	36.92	36.76	37.18
United Kingdom	129.6	123.1	138.24
United States	412.56	541.17	395.38
DAC Countries, Total	1465.6	1641.75	1424.88
African Development Bank [AfDB]	0.05	0.03	
African Development Fund [AfDF]	71.84	65.62	81.34
Arab Bank for Economic Development in Africa [BADEA]	1.34	4.7	6.25
Climate Investment Funds [CIF]		0.18	2.63



Development Partners	2012	2013	2014
EU Institutions	169.15	114.83	82.55
Food and Agriculture Organization [FAO]		0.81	
Global Alliance for Vaccines and Immunization [GAVI]	19.37	27.82	26.3
Global Environment Facility [GEF]	5.22	5.09	2.22
Global Fund	73.84	28.44	100.41
International Atomic Energy Agency [IAEA]	0.35	0.38	0.15
International Bank for Reconstruction and Development [IBRD]			
International Development Association [IDA]	223.07	368.91	317.45
IFAD	4.29	9.54	7.8
International Finance Corporation [IFC]			
IMF (Concessional Trust Funds)	-2.23	-2.96	-3.21
Islamic Development Bank [IsDB]	8.66	2.07	8.72
Nordic Development Fund [NDF]	-1.47	-1.59	3.45
OPEC Fund for International Development [OFID]	-2.18	-1.88	0.07
UNAIDS	1.14	1.27	1.12
UNDP	7.14	6.61	6.87
UNFPA	4.67	3.63	5.25
UNHCR	2.74	3.32	••
UNICEF	14.49	16.15	14.73
WFP	4.78	3.09	2.96
World Health Organization [WHO]	1.79	1.61	1.89
Multilateral, Total	608.05	657.67	668.95
Kuwait [KFAED]	-0.12	1.02	0.33
Russia	0.09	13.05	8
Thailand	0.02	0.12	0.22
Turkey	0.05	0.65	0.75
United Arab Emirates	0.31	0.4	0.31
Non-DAC Countries, Total	0.35	15.24	9.61
Development Partners Total	2,074.00	2,314.66	2,103.44

Source: OECD Stat Data as 1/06/16



## Annex Table 11: Economic and Social Indicators for Mozambique, 2012 - 2015

Series Name					MOZ	AFR	World
	2012	2013	2014	2015 *	ŀ	verage 2012-2	015
Growth and Inflation		-					
GDP growth (annual %)	7.2	7.1	7.2		7.2	4.2	2.4
GDP per capita growth (annual							
%)	4.2	4.2	4.3		4.2	1.4	1.2
GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	1,010.0	1,060.0	1,120.0		1,063.3	3,273.9	14,410.1
GNI per capita, Atlas method	1,010.0	1,000.0	1,120.0		1,003.3	5,275.9	14,410.1
(current US\$) (Millions)	520.0	590.0	600.0		570.0	1,605.1	10,629.6
Inflation, consumer prices							
(annual %)	2.7	4.3	2.6		3.2	5.5	3.0
Composition of GDP (%)							
Agriculture, value added (% of							
GDP)	27.6	26.6	25.2		26.5	14.8	3.1
Industry, value added (% of GDP)	19.1	18.7	21.1		19.6	27.4	26.6
Services, etc., value added (%	13.1	10.7	21.1		13.0	21.4	20.0
of GDP)	53.3	54.7	53.7		53.9	57.7	70.4
Gross fixed capital formation (%							
of GDP)	34.3	26.7	21.8		27.6	21.1	21.9
Gross domestic savings (% of GDP)	74	4.5	0.4		~ ~	40.0	00 5
/	7.1	4.5	8.1		6.6	18.8	22.5
External Accounts							
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	26.4	25.7	26.2		26.1	29.7	29.8
Imports of goods and services (% of GDP)	77.8	74.8	69.5		74.0	32.9	29.7
Current account balance (% of	10.0				10.0		
GDP)	-43.8	-36.8	·		-40.3		
External debt stocks (% of GNI)	32.7	45.0	47.6		41.8		
Total debt service (% of GNI)	0.5	0.9	1.1		0.8	1.7	
Total reserves in months of imports	2.9	3.2			3.0	5.1	13.5
Fiscal Accounts**	-				-		
General government revenue (%							
of GDP)	27.5	32.2	32.9	30.4	30.8		
General government total							
expenditure (% of GDP)	31.4	34.9	43.2	36.9	36.6		
General government net lending/borrowing (% of GDP)	-3.9	-2.7	-10.3	-6.5	-5.8		
General government gross debt	-3.3	-2.1	-10.3	-0.3	-0.0		-
(% of GDP)	40.8	52.2	57.5	61.0	52.9		
Social Indicators							
Health							
Life expectancy at birth, total							
(years)	54.2	54.6			54.4	57.8	71.1



Series Name					MOZ	AFR	World
	2012	2013	2014	2015 *	1	Average 2012-2	015
Immunization, DPT (% of children ages 12-23 months)	76.0	78.0	78.0		77.3	74.8	85.7
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	19.8	20.3	20.4	20.5	20.3	29.2	66.7
Improved water source (% of population with access)	36.3	37.0	37.0	37.0	36.8	54.5	83.4
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	63.6	60.9	58.5	56.7	59.9	58.9	33.2
Education							
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)						19.2	53.5
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	105.1	105.2			105.2	99.6	108.2
School enrollment, secondary (% gross)	25.9	26.0			26.0	42.6	74.6
Population							
Population, total (Millions)	25,732,928	26,467,180	27,216,276		26,472,128	948,481,133	7,174,847,128
Population growth (annual %)	2.8	2.8	2.8		2.8	2.8	1.2
Urban population (% of total)	31.4	31.7	31.9		31.7	36.7	52.9

Source: DDP as of 12/22/15

\* Data not available for 2015

\*\* International Monetary Fund, World Economic Outlook Database, October 2015 (estimates start after 2013)



# Annex Table 12: List of IFC Investments in Mozambique - Investments Committed in FY12-FY16 Investments Committed in FY12-FY16

Project ID	Cmt FY	Project Status	Primary Sector Name	Greenfield Code	Project Size	Original Loan	Original Equity	Original CMT	Loan Cancel	Equity Cancel	Net Loan	Net Equity	Net Comm
32522	2015	2015	Agriculture and Forestry	G	161,200	-	30,400	30,400	-	-	30,400	30,400	30,400
34183	2015	2015	Agriculture and Forestry	G	10,483	3,647	-	3,647	-	-	3,647	-	3,647
34708	2015	2015	Primary Metals	G	48,000	13,500	-	13,500	-	-	13,500	-	13,500
32703	2014	2014	Industrial & Consumer Products	G	85,300	35,000	-	35,000	-	-	35,000	-	35,000
34216	2014	2014	Oil, Gas and Mining	Е	1,954	-	977	977	-	-	977	977	977
34761	2014	2014	Oil, Gas and Mining	Е	2,834	-	2,834	2,834	-	-	2,834	2,834	2,834
33975	2013	2013	Agriculture and Forestry	Е	20,000	20,000	-	20,000	-	-	20,000	-	20,000
31153	2012	2012	Food & Beverages	E	58,200	25,000	-	25,000	-	-	25,000	-	25,000
31952	2012	2012	Oil, Gas and Mining	E	1,026	-	1,026	1,026	-	-	1,026	1,026	1,026
28162		Active	Oil, Gas and Mining	Е	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
34244		Active	Oil, Gas and Mining	G	977	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
			Sub-Total		389,973	97,147	35,236	132,383	-	-	132,383	35,236	132,383

## Investments Committed pre-FY12 but active during FY12-16

Project ID	CMT FY	Project Status	Primary Sector Name	Greenfield Code	Project Size	Original Loan	Original Equity	Original CMT	Loan Cancel	Equity Cancel	Net Loan	Net Equity	Net Comm
29163	2010	Active	Finance & Insurance	E	30,000	30,000	-	30,000	11,000	-	19,000	-	19,000
27248	2009	Active	Oil, Gas and Mining	G	20,000	-	5,000	5,000	-	-	5,000	5,000	5,000
10983	2004	Active	Oil, Gas and Mining	G	18,500	-	18,500	18,500	-	-	18,500	18,500	18,500
9997	2001	Active	Agriculture and Forestry	Е	2,352	715	-	715	-	-	715	-	715
8021	1998	Active	Food & Beverages	G	2,146	1,000	-	1,000	-	-	1,000	-	1,000
			Sub-Total		72,998	31,715	23,500	55,215	11,000	-	44,215	23,500	44,215
			TOTAL		462,971	128,862	58,736	187,598	11,000	-	176,598	58,736	176,598

Source: IFC-MIS Extract as of 1-31-17



## Annex Table 13: List of IFC Advisory Services for Mozambique Advisory Services Approved in FY12-16

Project ID	Project Name	Impl Start FY	Impl End FY	Project Status	Primary Business Line	Total Funds, US\$
585427	AMSME/WIN CAF	2016	2018	TERMINATED	FIG	600,000
600689	Sasol Vilankulo Hospital PPP Study	2016	2016	TERMINATED	CAS	817,905
573567	Sustainable Supply Chain in Mozambique	2015	2015	TERMINATED	INR	121,308
598347	Portucel Mozambique	2014	2017	ACTIVE	MAS	2,132,332
599406	Mozambique Water PPP 2	2014	2017	ACTIVE	CAS	2,530,415
599698	PEP Africa-G&A Mozambique	2014	2018	ACTIVE	CAS	21,529
564747	AMSMETA ABCH MZ.	2012	2015	CLOSED	FIG	1,220,000
583267	Mozambique Investment Climate Program	2012	2016	ACTIVE	TAC	1,024,229
	Sub-Total					8,467,718

## Advisory Services Approved pre-FY12 but active during FY12-16

Project ID	Project Name	Impl Start FY	lmpl End FY	Project Status	Primary Business Line	Total Funds, US\$
579027	Guy Carpenter & Company, LLC	2011	2013	CLOSED	A2F	1,000,000
581787	Mozambique Limpopo Transactional Advice	2011	2012	TERMINATED	IC	-
29065	Moza_Water PPP	2010	2012	TERMINATED	PPP	1,320,262
565308	MSI programme-New Tintas 2000	2010	2015	DROPPED	SBA	153,000
569790	Africa Credit Bureau Program 2 - Mozambique	2010	2011	CLOSED	A2F	269,666
574547	MSI Phase II - SMS Mozambique	2010	2012	DROPPED	SBA	1,314,500
544007	MOZ Tourism Anchor Program	2007	2011	CLOSED	IC	1,905,149
	Sub-Total					5,962,577
	TOTAL					14,430,295

## Regional Advisory Projects Active in Mozambique from FY12-16

Project ID	Project Name	Impl Start FY	lmpl End FY	Project Status	Primary Business Line	Total Funds, US\$
600563	SSA Index Insurance Program	2015	2019	ACTIVE	FAM	5,000,000
587469	BAREC	2012	2016	ACTIVE	MAS	-
578327	SME Management Solutions	2012	2015	CLOSED	CAS	4,691,056
	TOTAL					9,691,056

Source: IFC AS Data as of June 30, 2016



## Annex Table 14: IFC Net Commitment Activity for Mozambique

		2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	Total
Financial Markets		-	-	-	-	(11,000,000)	(11,000,000)
Trade Finance (TF)		12,987,689	19,647,879	2,526,713	-	-	35,162,281
	Primary Production & Commodity Processing	-	20,000,000	-	3,355,050	(455)	23,354,595
Agribusiness & Forestry	Packaged Food & Beverages	25,000,000	-	-	-	-	25,000,000
·	Forest & Wood Products	-	-	-	30,400,000	- (11,000,000)  0 (455)  0 0  	30,400,000
	Construction Materials	-	-	-	13,500,000	-	13,500,000
Manufacturing	Energy Efficient Machinery	-	-	35,000,000	-	-	35,000,000
Oil, Gas & Mining	Mining	1,025,609	-	3,810,691	-	-	4,836,300
Total	-	39,013,298	39,647,879	41,337,404	47,255,050	(11,000,455)	156,253,176

Source: IFC MIS as of 3/10/17

## Annex Table 15: List of MIGA Activities in Mozambique

Contract Enterprise	FY	Project Status	Sector	Investor	Max Gross Issuance
Gigawatt Mozambique SA	2016	Active	Power	South Africa	115
Sojitz Maputo Cellulose, Limitada (SOMACEL)	2011	Active	Manufacturing	Japan	9
Companhia de Sena S.A.R.L.	2007	Active	Agribusiness	Mauritius	22
Motraco-Mozambique Transmission Company S.A.R.L.	2000	Active	Power	South Africa	69
Total					216